BME Participation in Postgraduate Research
Thematic Bibliography
Contents

BAME Definition ........................................................................................................... 5

Intersectionality: Ethnicities, Nationalities, Gender, Religion ......................... 6
  Black Doctoral Students ............................................................................................ 6
  International BME Student-specific ........................................................................ 6
  BME women in doctoral education ......................................................................... 7
  BME men in doctoral education .............................................................................. 8
  Muslim Students in Higher Education .................................................................... 9

Progression into and through the Doctorate ......................................................... 10
  Access to Postgraduate Research ......................................................................... 10
  Lack of Developmental Opportunities Available for BAME Students ................. 11
  Financial Pressure on BAME Students .................................................................. 11
  Mental Health and Wellbeing ............................................................................... 12
  Career Progression: Disparities in Furthering an Academic Career After PhD for BAME
  Doctoral Students .................................................................................................... 13

Institutional Challenges ......................................................................................... 14
  Institutional Racism ............................................................................................... 14
  The Awarding / Attainment Gap ............................................................................ 15
  Lack of BME Staff .................................................................................................. 15
  Diversity Policies and Practices in Academia ......................................................... 17
  Mentoring ................................................................................................................. 17
  Discipline-Specific Challenges ............................................................................... 18

History of Black Participation in Higher Education ............................................. 19

Identification of Research Gaps in the Existing Scholarship ......................... 20
Foreword

We believe that greater diversity within both PGT and PGR provision generates better research, knowledge that is more reflective of current society, and is fundamental to our understanding of universities as public institutions. Ensuring inclusivity in postgraduate education is therefore at the heart of furthering our economic, scientific, and social progress.

We also seek to widen access to postgraduate research in order to broaden who will be considered, in Paul Wakeling’s succinct phrase, ‘tomorrow’s knowledge-creators’.

In September 2019, Leading Routes published a report, ‘The Broken Pipeline: Barriers to Black PhD Students Accessing Research Council Funding’ that revealed that only 1.2% of research council funded studentships went to Black or Black Mixed students over a three 3-year period. Wakeling, Hancock and Chubb have urged the sector to consider who is responsible for postgraduate access work and called for better tracking of postgraduate access, experiences and outcomes.

This thematic bibliography is the first of a series of resources and insights we intend to produce from the UKCGE Black and Minority Ethnic Participation in Postgraduate Research Working Group. The group brings together academics and higher education professionals from across the UK and exists to deepen our understanding of BME participation at the PGR level, to identify, share and celebrate examples of effective practices that have encouraged and sustained BME participation in postgraduate research and to make policy recommendations to increase participation on the basis of that analysis.

This is a live document, not an exhaustive list of the available literature, but a first step in assembling these works together in one place to focus minds. Whilst work exists on access to undergraduate study by ethnicity, less is known about the access, numbers, strategies and experiences of BME researchers at a postgraduate research level. We intend the bibliography to be a resource for the sector to improve our literacy on these themes and to stimulate further research. We aim to encourage empathy, allyship and action, as well as to sustain and grow initiatives already begun.
This is a live document, and by no means exhaustive, assembled for us principally by group member and doctoral researcher Sana Iqbal of Coventry University. It focuses on the UK Higher Education sector with additional content drawn in particular, from the US. Please do contact us with recommendations for additional material that should be included.

Dr Rochelle Rowe-Wiseman
Academic Development Lead, UCL & Executive Committee Member and Trustee of UK Council for Graduate Education

Acknowledgements

The UK Council for Graduate Education gratefully acknowledges the research of Sana Iqbal (PhD Researcher, Coventry University) in producing this resource. This research was made possible through the generous support of Coventry University and their Research Residencies programme.
BAME Definition

Diversity, inclusion, and doctoral study: challenges facing minority PhD students in the United Kingdom
*European Political Science*, 15:4  

The term Black and Minority Ethnic (BME) refers to those who are from Bangladeshi, Pakistani, Indian, Indian other, Chinese, Asian other, Black African, Black Caribbean, other Black backgrounds, White and Asian mixed, White and African Caribbean mixed, other mixed background and other ethnic backgrounds. BME is not to be taken as a homogeneous group but to be acknowledged as individual ethnic groups underneath such labelling. (Mattocks and Briscoe-Palmer, 2016: 489).

Black Bodies ‘Out of Place’ in Academic Spaces: Gender, Race, Faith and Culture in Post-race Times, in J. Arday and H. S. Mirza (eds.), Dismantling Race in Higher Education.  

The acronym BME or BAME (Black and Minority Ethnic and Black Asian and Minority Ethnic) is a collective term used in official British government sources to encompass the highly differentiated racialised post-colonial but global majority ‘peoples of colour’ who now live and work in Great Britain. It denotes the social construction of difference through visible ‘race’ (Black) and ethnic (cultural) markers.
Intersectionality: Ethnicities, Nationalities, Gender, Religion

Black Doctoral Students

Barker, M. J. (2011)
Racial context, currency and connections: Black doctoral student and white advisor perspectives on cross-race advising.
*Innovations in Education and Teaching International*  
https://doi.org/10.1080/14703297.2011.617092

Harris, A. (2019)
The Disciplines Where No Black People Earn Ph.D.s  
*The Atlantic*, 19 April 2019  

*Palgrave Macmillan US*,  

Ruiz, Elsa C. (2013)
*New Jersey: Wiley* 163: 35-42

Shavers, M. C., & Moore, J. L. (2014)
Black Female Voices: Self-Presentation Strategies in Doctoral Programs at Predominately White Institutions (PWIs)  
*Journal of College Student Development*.  
https://doi.org/10.1353/csd.2014.0040
International BME Student-specific

Arday, J. (2017)
*University and College Union (UCU): London: Creative Commons.*

Evans, C., & Stevenson, K. (2011)
The experience of international nursing students studying for a PhD in the U.K: A qualitative study.

Stevenson, J. (2017)
Exploring the lifeworld of international doctoral students: the place of religion and religious organisations In Gomes, C. and Tran, L. (eds) International Student Connectedness and Identity Transnational Perspectives. Cultural Studies and Trans-disciplinarity in Education.

BME women in doctoral education

Gender Gaps in Higher Education Participation: An Analysis of the Relationship between Prior Attainment and Young Participation by Gender, Socio-Economic Class and Ethnicity.
*DIUS Research Report 08-14.*

“Where are you really from?” Female BME students’ narratives of encountering racial-microaggressions in their everyday university experiences.
*PhD thesis, University of Sheffield.* [http://etheses.whiterose.ac.uk/21917/](http://etheses.whiterose.ac.uk/21917/)

How Race and Gender Biases Impact Students in Higher Ed.

"Involuntary "Whiteness": The Acculturation of Black Doctoral Female Students in the Field of Clinical Psychology". Dissertations & Theses. 500.
https://aura.antioch.edu/etds/500

Talented women of colour are blocked-why are there so few black female professors? The Guardian. Feb 5th, 2019.
https://www.theguardian.com/education/2019/feb/05/talented-women-of-colour-are-blocked-why-are-there-so-few-black-female-professors

Patterson-Stephens, S. M.; Lane, T. B.; and Vital, L. M. (2017)
Black Doctoral Women: Exploring Barriers and Facilitators of Success in Graduate Education,  
Higher Education Politics & Economics: Vol. 3: Iss. 1, Article 5.
https://digitalcommons.odu.edu/aphe/vol3/iss1/5

Reddick, B. L. (2011)
Lifting as We Climb: African American Women's Education Experience in the Ivory Tower.  

Shavers, M. C., & Moore, J. L. (2014)  
Black Female Voices: Self-Presentation Strategies in Doctoral Programs at Predominately White Institutions.  
Journal of College Student Development. https://doi.org/10.1353/csd.2014.0040

BME men in doctoral education

IOWA State University (2018).  
Experience of Black doctoral students underscores need to increase diversity in STEM fields.  
Reis, Rick (2016)
Socializing Black Male Ph.D. Students to the Professoriate: Tomorrow’s Academic Careers
https://tomprof.stanford.edu/posting/1569-2

Muslim Students in Higher Education
Malik, Abida & Wykes, Emily (2018)
British Muslims in UK Higher Education REPORT Socio-political, religious and policy considerations
Progression into and through the Doctorate

Access to Postgraduate Research

Understanding Admitted Doctoral Students’ Institutional Choices: Student Experiences versus Faculty and Staff Perceptions.
American Journal of Education. https://doi.org/10.1086/676923

Boliver, V. (2013)
How fair is access to more prestigious UK universities?
British Journal of Sociology 64(2):344-364

Increasing the number of African American PhDs in the sciences and engineering: A strengths-based approach.
American Psychologist, 59(6), 547-556.

Widening participation to doctoral education and research degrees: a research agenda for an emerging policy issue.
Higher Education Research & Development, 32:2, 214-227
https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/07294360.2012.662630

Posselt, Julie R. (2016)
Inside Graduate Admissions: Merit, Diversity and Faculty Gatekeeping
Cambridge: Harvard University Press
https://www.hup.harvard.edu/catalog.php?isbn=9780674088696

Tolley, J & Rundle J. (2006)
A Review of Black and Minority Ethnic Participation in Higher Education
Aim Higher Report
https://www.heacademy.ac.uk/system/files/ah_hefce_black_minority_participation.pdf

Wakeling, Paul and Hancock, Sally (2019)
Who’s responsible for postgraduate access work?
https://wonkhe.com/blogs/whos-responsible-for-postgraduate-access-work/
Wakeling, Paul and Hancock, Sally (2019)
21st Century PhDs: Why we need better methods of tracking doctoral access, experiences and outcomes
Research on Research Institute
https://figshare.com/articles/21st_Century_PhDs_Why_we_need_better_methods_of_tracking_doctoral_access_experiences_and_outcomes/9917813

Lack of Developmental Opportunities Available for BAME Students

Arday, J. (2017)
University and College Union (UCU): London: Creative Commons.

Placement Work Experience May Mitigate Lower Achievement Levels of Black and Asian vs. White Students at University.

Singh, G. (2011)
Black and Minority Ethnic (BME) Students’ Participation in Higher Education: Improving Retention and Success—A Synthesis of Research Evidence.

Financial Pressure on BAME Students

Fazackerley, A. (2019)
Look at how white the academy is: why BAME students aren’t doing PhDs.
Global Research Universities (2019).

Han, O. (2019)
Ethnic minority pupils get worse degrees and jobs, even if they have better A-levels.
New Statesman America.
https://www.newstatesman.com/politics/education/2019/02/ethnic-minority-pupils-get-worse-degrees-and-jobs-even-if-they-have
Harvey, A., Andrewartha, L. (2013)  
Dr Who? Equity and diversity among university postgraduate and higher degree cohorts.  
*Journal of Higher Education Policy and Management, 35:2, 112-123*  

Mattocks, K. and Briscoe-Palmer, S. (2016)  
Diversity, inclusion, and doctoral study: challenges facing minority PhD students in the United Kingdom.  

Williams, P., Bath, S., Arday, J and Lewis, C (2019)  
Broken Pipeline: Barriers to Black PhD Students Accessing Research Council Funding.  
*Leading Routes.* https://leadingroutes.org/research

**Mental Health and Wellbeing**

Arday, J. (2018)  
Understanding Mental Health: What Are the Issues for Black and Ethnic Minority Students at University?  

Gildersleeve, R. E., Croom, N. N., & Vasquez, P. L. (2011)  
“Am I going crazy?!”: A critical race analysis of doctoral education.  
*Equity & Excellence in Education, 44*(1), 93-114.  
https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/10665684.2011.539472

Weale, S., Batty, D., and Obordo, R. (2019)  
‘A demeaning environment’: stories of racism in UK universities.  
Career Progression: Disparities in Furthering an Academic Career After PhD for BAME Doctoral Students

Aiming Higher Race, Inequality and Diversity in the Academy. London: AHRC: Runnymede Trust (Runnymede Perspectives)

Academic Flight: how to encourage black and minority ethnic academics to stay in UK higher education.

Why the difference? A closer look at higher education minority ethnic students and graduates (Research Report No. 552).
Institutional Challenges

Institutional Racism

Universities failing to address thousands of racist incidents.

Boliver, V. (2016)
Exploring Ethnic Inequalities in Admission to Russell Group Universities.
Sociology. https://doi.org/10.1177/0038038515575859

Choudhry, I. (2019)
I’ve seen first-hand that academic spaces have a problem with racial slurs – no wonder PhD students are quitting
The Independent 8 July 2019
https://www.independent.co.uk/voices/academic-racism-university-cambridge-n-word-priyamvada-gopal-a8993016.html

Graham. E.
Somerset, New Jersey: Wiley 163 (2013): 77-88

Grove J (2013)
‘Small’ Russell Group racial bias in admissions: UCAS.

How is ‘racism’ understood in literature about the experiences of black and minority ethnic, social work students in Britain? A conceptual review
Social Work Education Volume 38, (5).
http://usir.salford.ac.uk/id/eprint/50038/?template=banner
Cambridge University assigning ethnic minority mentors to white academics is a scheme we can all learn from.
*The Independent* 3 July 2019 [https://inews.co.uk/opinion/columnists/cambridge-university-ethnic-minority-mentors-white-academics-racism-scheme-499275?fbclid=IwAR1wRwFvYflYfCYDjhu7ZiCiz6vQ5qmqwuaJG9SMyFJDiHDkqNy94M9Io6y](https://inews.co.uk/opinion/columnists/cambridge-university-ethnic-minority-mentors-white-academics-racism-scheme-499275?fbclid=IwAR1wRwFvYflYfCYDjhu7ZiCiz6vQ5qmqwuaJG9SMyFJDiHDkqNy94M9Io6y)

Pells, R. (2019)
Cambridge PhD student quits over ‘structural racism.
*Times Higher Education* 1 July 2019

Neves, J. (2018)
Postgraduate Research Experience Survey.
*York: Advance HE* [https://www.heacademy.ac.uk/institutions/surveys/postgraduate-research-experience-survey](https://www.heacademy.ac.uk/institutions/surveys/postgraduate-research-experience-survey)

**The Awarding / Attainment Gap**

Understanding the gender and ethnicity attainment gap in UK higher education
*Innovations in Education and Teaching International*, 53:5, 475-486

Preparing underrepresented students of colour for doctoral success: The role of undergraduate institutions.
*International Journal of Doctoral Studies*. [https://doi.org/10.28945/1901](https://doi.org/10.28945/1901)

Miller, M. (2016)
The Ethnicity Attainment Gap: Literature review.
*Sheffield: The University of Sheffield Widening Participation Research & Evaluation Unit* [https://www.sheffield.ac.uk/polopoly_fs/1.661523!/file/BME_Attainment_Gap_Literature_Review_EXTERNAL_-_Miriam_Miller.pdf](https://www.sheffield.ac.uk/polopoly_fs/1.661523!/file/BME_Attainment_Gap_Literature_Review_EXTERNAL_-_Miriam_Miller.pdf)

‘Transcendence over Diversity: Black women in the academy’. 
*Policy Futures in Education*, 4 (2) 
[https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.2304/pfie.2006.4.2.101](https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.2304/pfie.2006.4.2.101)
Tate, S. Anne, and Bagguley, P. (2017)
Building the anti-racist university: Next steps.
Race Ethnicity and Education 20: 289–99
https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/13613324.2016.1260227

Wakeling P. (2009)
Are Ethnic Minorities Underrepresented in UK Postgraduate Study?
Higher Education Quarterly, Vol. 63, Issue 1

Lack of BME Staff

Bhopal, K. (2019)
Gender, ethnicity and career progression in UK higher education: a case study analysis
Research Papers in Education.

Desai, Vandana (2017)
Black and Minority Ethnic (BME) students and staff in contemporary British Geography

Gabriel, Deborah & Tate, Shirley Anne (2017)
Inside the Ivory Tower: Narratives of women of colour surviving and thriving in British academia.

HEPI (2019)
The white elephant in the room: ideas for reducing racial inequality in higher education.

How can we make not break black and minority ethnic leaders in higher education?
UK: Leadership Foundation for Higher Education.
https://www.lfhe.ac.uk/en/components/publication.cfm/KwhaliST31
Diversity Policies and Practices in Academia

Ahmed, Sara (2012)
On Being Included: Racism and Diversity in Institutional Life.

Barker, M. J. (2010)
Cross-race advising relationships: The role of race in advising relationships between Black doctoral student proteges and their White faculty advisors (Unpublished doctoral dissertation).
Louisiana State University, Baton Rouge https://digitalcommons.lsu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=2169&context=gradschool_dissertations

My Story, my identity: doctoral students of colour at a research university.
Qualitative Research in Education, 5(3), 276-308. https://pdxscholar.library.pdx.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1052&context=elp_fac

Falling between the Cracks: What Diversity Means for Black Women in Higher Education.

Mattocks, K. and Briscoe-Palmer, S. (2016)
Diversity, inclusion, and doctoral study: challenges facing minority PhD students in the United Kingdom.
European Political Science https://link.springer.com/article/10.1057/s41304-016-0071-x

Mentoring

Apperson, A. (2019)
Mentorship experiences of doctoral students: Effects on program satisfaction and ideal mentor qualities.
Master's Theses and Doctoral Dissertations. 968. https://commons.emich.edu/theses/968
Effects of Mentoring on the quality of the Doctoral Experience at Historically Black Colleges and Universities: Results of Groundwork Investigation.

Sanders, D. R. (2016)
Mentoring Experiences of African American Doctoral Students at Historically Black and Historically White Colleges and Universities.

**Discipline-Specific Challenges**

Atkinson, H. et al. (2018)
Race, Ethnicity & Equality in UK History: A Report and Resource for Change

Desai, Vandana (2017)
Black and Minority Ethnic (BME) students and staff in contemporary British Geography

How is 'racism' understood in literature about the experiences of black and minority ethnic, social work students in Britain? A conceptual review
*Social Work Education Volume 38, (5).* [http://usir.salford.ac.uk/id/eprint/50038/?template=banner](http://usir.salford.ac.uk/id/eprint/50038/?template=banner)
History of Black Participation in Higher Education

Davis, Deanna & Maldonado, Cecilia (2015)
Shattering the Glass Ceiling: The Leadership Development of African American Women in Higher Education
Advancing Women in Leadership 35: 48-64

Evans, Stephanie Y.

Key Events in Black Higher Education
Identification of Research Gaps in the Existing Scholarship

Based on the research undertaken to produce this bibliography; the following gaps are evident:

- Lack of research on into BAME doctoral students to allow for comparison between different ethnic groups, regarding non-academic challenges encountered by them such as, for instance, poor wellbeing, despite the heterogeneity in BME across different ethnicities

- Comparison between London universities, and universities around the UK, in terms of what support systems are available to BME PGRs is very limited.

- In-depth study of challenges faced by BME PGRs due to their religious beliefs in academia

- Limited research into the experiences of black men in doctoral education, as compared with the literature on black women pursuing research degrees. A sample, focusing on the US is provided here.

- Comparison between UK-domiciled and international BME students is scarce, especially in terms of the relationship between academic performance and their personal and social lives (social integration).

- No significant literature on evidence-based inclusion initiatives undertaken by different universities to foster an institution’s social and academic environments for BAME PhD students. For an example, see this resource on ‘Doctoral Programmes for
Women of Colour’, a US resource:


- Lack of literature analysing rates of withdrawal from doctoral programmes in the UK by ethnicity, gender, disability and other relevant and intersecting characteristics.
ABOUT THE UKCGE

THE VOICE OF THE POSTGRADUATE COMMUNITY

The UK Council for Graduate Education is the leading independent representative body for postgraduate education in the UK. The Council is a membership organisation providing high-quality leadership and support to our members, to promote a strong and sustainable national postgraduate sector.

Through our comprehensive professional development and networking events, the UKCGE has been supporting excellence in the postgraduate sector for over 20 years. Our world-class events — covering both PGR & PGT — are designed, developed, and delivered by your sector colleagues. Giving you real-world insights, practical learnings & evidence of excellent practice.

www.ukcge.ac.uk
Tel: 01543 308602
Email: ukcge@ukcge.ac.uk