

**Sheffield  
Hallam  
University**

Sheffield  
Institute  
of Education



Yorkshire Consortium for  
Equity in Doctoral Education

# Challenges in evaluating collaborative postgraduate widening participation work

Lucy Clague  
Colin McCaig

# Presentation structure

- What is the YCEDE Programme?
- Outline of the YCEDE evaluation
- Partnership challenges

# What is YCEDE?

A collaboration between five universities in Yorkshire, 12 UKRI funded Doctoral Training partnerships and Centres for Doctoral Training plus a number of external partners dedicated to equity at doctoral level.

Central to YCEDE is the question of access to doctoral study for graduates from Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic backgrounds.



The University  
Of  
Sheffield.

Sheffield  
Hallam  
University



# What does YCEDE want to change?

1. Widening opportunities to ensure equity of access to and participation in research.
2. Changing institutional practices and culture to reduce inequality in offer rates.
3. Ensuring that we deliver an excellent experience for PGRs from ethnically minoritised groups by developing institutions in which they feel a valued part of the wider scholarly community.
4. Provide an evidence base for interventions to share widely across the HE sector and beyond.

# The Evaluation plan

1. Constructed programme and work-strand logic models and theories of change
2. Used the mechanisms and outcomes to develop appropriate evaluation methods alongside an implementation evaluation
3. The methods:
  - quantitative data analysis of institutional PGR data
  - monitoring data for programme activity
  - documentary analysis of academic selectors' criteria and practices
  - pre/post activity surveys with PGR applicants and students
  - interviews with programme leads and staff
  - co-creation style listening rooms interviews

# Challenges evaluating collaborative programmes

1. Institutional differences
2. Disciplinary differences
3. Data challenges

# Institutional variations

- number / proportion of PGRs varies

# Institutional variations

- number / proportion of PGRs varies
- size and discipline mix



# Institutional variations

- number / proportion of PGRs varies
- size and discipline mix
- variable links to DTPs and Research Councils

# Institutional variations

- number / proportion of PGRs varies
- size and discipline mix
- variable links to DTPs and Research Councils
- importance of PGR to institutional mission and the way responsibility is located varies

# Institutional variations

- number / proportion of PGRs varies
- size and discipline mix
- variable links to DTPs and Research Councils
- importance of PGR to institutional mission and the way responsibility is located varies
- centralised versus autonomous systems – e.g. admissions

# Disciplinary variations

- academic disciplines – humanities, arts, social sciences (cohort sizes)

# Disciplinary variations

- academic disciplines – humanities, arts, social sciences (cohort sizes)
- natural sciences and other vocational disciplines

# Disciplinary variations

- academic disciplines – humanities, arts, social sciences (cohort sizes)
- natural sciences and other vocational disciplines
- role of professional bodies (BMA, Law Society, Institute of Physics etc)

# Disciplinary variations

- academic disciplines – humanities, arts, social sciences (cohort sizes)
- natural sciences and other vocational disciplines
- role of professional bodies (BMA, Law Society, Institute of Physics etc)
- Cohort size variation:
  - natural sciences often recruit larger numbers – more scope for adjusting selection practices to address bias

# Disciplinary variations

- academic disciplines – humanities, arts, social sciences (cohort sizes)
- natural sciences and other vocational disciplines
- role of professional bodies (BMA, Law Society, Institute of Physics etc)
  
- Cohort size variation:
  - natural sciences often recruit larger numbers – more scope for adjusting selection practices to address bias
  - social sciences/humanities – more of an individualised recruitment process



# Data challenges around collaborative working

- GDPR and laws around personal data
- Data sharing agreements
- Permissions/consent
- Data extraction

# Want to know more?



@theYCEDE  
@lucy\_clague  
@colin\_mccaig



[l.clague@shu.ac.uk](mailto:l.clague@shu.ac.uk)  
[c.mccaig@shu.ac.uk](mailto:c.mccaig@shu.ac.uk)  
[info@ycede.ac.uk](mailto:info@ycede.ac.uk)



Subscribe to the YCEDE newsletter at [www.ycede.ac.uk](http://www.ycede.ac.uk)



Data sharing across institutions blog post at:  
<https://blogs.shu.ac.uk/sioe/posts/>